

ASB Standard 140, First Edition
2020

**Standard for Training in Forensic Human Mitochondrial
DNA Analysis, Interpretation, Statistical Evaluation, and
Reporting**



Standard for Training in Forensic Human Mitochondrial DNA Analysis, Interpretation, Statistical Evaluation, and Reporting

ASB Approved Xxxxx 2020

ANSI Approved Xxxxxx 2020



Academy Standards Board
410 North 21st Street
Colorado Springs, CO 80904

This document may be downloaded for free at: www.asbstandardsboard.org

This document is provided by the AAFS Standards Board for free. You are permitted to print and download the document and extracts from the document for your own use, provided that:

- *you do not modify this document or its related graphics in any way;*
- *you do not use any illustrations or any graphics separately from any accompanying text; and,*
- *you include an acknowledgement alongside the copied material noting the AAFS Standards Board as the copyright holder and publisher.*

You expressly agree not to reproduce, duplicate, copy, sell, resell, or exploit for any commercial purposes, this document or any portion of it. You may create a hyperlink to www.asbstandardsboard.org to allow persons to download their individual, free copy of this document. Your hyperlink must not portray AAFS, the AAFS Standards Board, this document, our agents, associates and affiliates in an offensive manner, or be misleading or false. You may not use our trademarks as part of your link without our written agreement for you to do so.

The AAFS Standards Board retains the sole right to submit this document to any other forum for any purpose.

Certain commercial entities, equipment or materials may be identified in this document to describe a procedure or concept adequately. Such identification is not intended to imply recommendations or endorsement by the AAFS or the AAFS Standards Board, nor is it intended to imply that the entities, materials, or equipment are necessarily the best available for the purpose.

*This document is copyrighted © by the AAFS Standards Board, LLC. 2020 All rights are reserved.
410 North 21st Street, Colorado Springs, CO 80904, www.asbstandardsboard.org.*

Foreword

This standard defines the minimum requirements for a Forensic DNA Analyst training program for human mitochondrial DNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting. The aim is to provide a framework for training that will result in quality and consistency in the forensic DNA community.

This document is part of a series of training documents under ANSI/ASB Standard 022, *Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs*.

This document was revised, prepared, and finalized as a standard by the DNA Consensus Body of the AAFS Standards Board. The draft of this standard was developed by the Biology/DNA Biological Data Interpretation and Reporting Subcommittee of the Organization of Scientific Area Committees (OSAC) for Forensic Science.

The AAFS Standards Board (ASB) is an ANSI-accredited Standards Developing Organization with the purpose of providing accessible, high quality science-based consensus forensic standards. The ASB is a wholly owned subsidiary of the American Academy of Forensic Sciences (AAFS), established in 2015 and accredited by the American National Standards Institute (ANSI) in 2016. The ASB consists of Consensus Bodies (CB), which are open to all materially interested and affected individuals, companies, and organizations; a Board of Directors; and Staff.

The following applies to all ASB documents:

the term '**shall**' indicates that a provision is mandatory, and can be audited for compliance

the term '**should**' indicates that a provision is not mandatory, but recommended as good practice.

All hyperlinks and web addresses shown in this document are current as of the publication date of this standard.

Keywords: *Training, human Mitochondrial DNA, interpretation.*

Table of Contents

1	Scope.....
2	Normative References.....
3	Terms and Definitions.....
4	Requirements.....
4.1	General	
4.2	Knowledge Based.....
4.3	Practical Training.....
4.4	Competency Testing.....
5	Conformance.....
	Annex A (informative) Bibliography.....

DRAFT

Standard for Training in Forensic Human Mitochondrial DNA Analysis, Interpretation, Statistical Evaluation, and Reporting

1 Scope

This document provides the requirements for a forensic DNA laboratory's training program in forensic human mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting.

2 Normative References

The following reference is indispensable for the application of the standard. For dated references, only the edition cited applies. For undated references, the latest edition of the referenced document (including any amendments) applies.

ANSI/ASB Standard 022, *Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs*

3 Terms and Definitions

For purposes of this document, the following definitions apply.

3.1

control region

A presumed non-coding portion of the mitochondrial DNA molecule analyzed through DNA sequencing, which may be used to determine an individual's mitochondrial haplotype or for taxonomic discrimination. The control region often contains hypervariable regions (in humans: HV1 and HV2) that differ in sequence among non-maternally related individuals. The control region encompasses the D-loop region in humans and other species.

3.2

haplogroup

A group of similar haplotypes that share a common ancestor with a single-nucleotide polymorphism mutation.

3.3

haplotype

A set of linked DNA variations, or polymorphisms, that tend to be inherited together (e.g., commonly used for human Y-chromosome or mitochondrial analysis). A haplotype can refer to a combination of alleles or to a set of single nucleotide polymorphisms (SNPs) found on the same chromosome.

3.4

heteroplasmy

The presence of more than one mitochondrial DNA (mtDNA) sequence or type within a single individual.

3.5

homopolymeric stretches

A segment of DNA consisting of repeats of a single nucleotide; may cause slippage during amplification and sequencing.

3.6
hypervariable region 1
HVI

A section of the human mtDNA control region spanning nucleotide positions 16024-16365, that often differs among non-maternally related individuals.

3.7
hypervariable region 2
HVII

A section of the human mtDNA control region spanning nucleotide positions 73-340, that often differs among non-maternally related individuals.

3.8
nuclear mitochondrial DNA segment
NUMT

A transposition of any type of cytoplasmic mitochondrial DNA into the nuclear genome of a eukaryotic organism.

3.9
Revised Cambridge Reference Sequence
rCRS

A fully corrected version of the original Cambridge Reference Sequence (GenBank# J01415.0 gi:337188) of Anderson et al (1981) of the human mitochondrial genome (mtDNA), also referred to as the Anderson sequence. The rCRS is GenBank sequence NC_012920; it differs from the original CRS and other complete mtDNA GenBank sequences in that it has eighteen corrected or confirmed nucleotides. It is used for reporting human mtDNA sequences, generally by denoting the differences observed from the rCRS.

3.10
transition

A mutation that results in a change from one purine to the other purine (e.g., A-to-G) or one pyrimidine to the other pyrimidine (e.g., C-to-T).

3.11
transversion

A mutation that results in a change from a purine to pyrimidine or vice versa (e.g., A-to-T).

4 Requirements

4.1 General

ANSI/ASB Standard 022, *Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs* shall be used in conjunction with this document because ANSI/ASB Standard 022 provides the foundational training program requirements upon which additional specific requirements, such as this document, will be based.

4.2 Knowledge-based Training

4.2.1 The laboratory's training program shall provide the trainee with an understanding of the fundamental principles of forensic human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting, including the laboratory's own mtDNA protocols.

4.2.2 At a minimum, the knowledge-based portion of the training program shall require review of the following:

- a) the laboratory's protocols for mtDNA sequence comparisons;
- b) the laboratory's applicable validation studies;
- c) literature used to support validation and the test methods in the laboratory; and
- d) applicable literature as assigned by the trainer.

4.2.3 At a minimum, the knowledge-based portion of the training program shall cover the following topics.

NOTE Knowledge of historical methods is intended to provide an educated perspective on current methods.

- a) General biology of human mtDNA including:
 - 1) structure;
 - 2) control region [hypervariable region 1 (HVI); hypervariable region 2 (HVII)];
 - 3) gene composition of the mtDNA genome;
 - 4) copy number of mtDNA;
 - 5) mtDNA related diseases;
 - 6) homopolymeric stretches;
 - 7) Nuclear Mitochondrial DNA segment (NUMT); and
 - 8) differences between nuclear DNA (nDNA) and mtDNA (e.g., copy number, location, structure, size, inheritance mode, recombination).
- b) Inheritance of mtDNA, including:
 - 1) maternal;
 - 2) transmission of mtDNA from sperm;
 - 3) mutation;
 - i) rates,

- ii) hotspots,
 - iii) transitions/transversions,
 - iv) insertions/deletions.
- c) Heteroplasmy, including:
- 1) types;
 - 2) rate;
 - 3) prevalence in various tissues;
 - 4) family studies with heteroplasmy;
 - 5) effect of heteroplasmy on forensic mtDNA analysis.
- d) Sequence alignment, including:
- 1) Revised Cambridge Reference Sequence (rCRS);
 - 2) interpretation of length heteroplasmic sequences;
 - 3) nomenclature.
- e) Evaluation of controls, including:
- 1) reagent blanks;
 - 2) negative controls;
 - 3) positive controls.
- f) Comparison of evidentiary data to known sample data, including:
- 1) cannot exclude;
 - 2) exclusion;
 - 3) inconclusive;
 - 4) not suitable for comparison.
- g) Databases, including:
- 1) diversity among and within ethnic groups;
 - 2) haplogroup;
 - 3) composition of mtDNA sequence databases:

- i) SWGDAM (forensic),
 - ii) The European DNA Profiling Group Mitochondrial DNA Population Database (EMPOP) (forensic),
 - iii) other published databases;
- 4) mtDNA sequence database searches:
- i) difference-coded haplotype searches,
 - ii) string based searches.
- h) Statistics and reporting (as established and used by the laboratory), including:
- 1) calculation of frequencies and confidence intervals (profile probabilities);
 - 2) calculation of a population correction factor, match probabilities, and confidence intervals (credible intervals);
 - 3) calculation of likelihood ratios;
 - 4) reporting of results:
 - i) profile probabilities,
 - ii) match probabilities,
 - iii) likelihood ratios;
 - 5) reporting of conclusions:
 - i) cannot exclude,
 - ii) exclusion,
 - iii) inconclusive,
 - iv) not suitable for comparison.

4.3 Practical Training

4.3.1 The laboratory's training program shall provide the trainee with sufficient practical instruction for the trainee to obtain the skills for performing forensic human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting protocols used by the laboratory.

4.3.2 At a minimum, the practical portion of the training program shall include the observation of the process at least once or until clearly understood with exercises representative of the range, type, and complexity of routine casework or database samples processed by the laboratory. These include:

- a) mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting to be utilized by the trainee;
- b) the use of appropriate controls;
- c) proper documentation of the process.

4.3.3 At a minimum, the practical portion of the training program shall include hands-on or file review exercises representative of the range, type, and complexity of casework or database samples processed by the laboratory. These include:

- a) mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting to be utilized by the trainee;
- b) evaluation of controls and expected results;
- c) proper documentation of the process;
- d) The number and quality of samples processed by the trainee shall be appropriate to demonstrate the ability to follow the laboratory's mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting protocols(s) and to produce reliable and accurate results.

4.4 Competency Testing

4.4.1 General

The laboratory's training program shall include knowledge-based and practical competency in the application of human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting. The format of the test(s) shall meet Section 4.3 of ANSI/ASB Standard 022, *Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs*.

4.4.2 Knowledge-based Competency

The trainee shall successfully complete a knowledge-based test covering the critical information obtained during the training of human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, comparison, statistical evaluation, and reporting methods. The test(s) shall cover, at a minimum:

- a) the theoretical and scientific bases of human mtDNA interpretation, comparison, statistical evaluation, and reporting;
- b) the function of the reagents and other components used in each method;
- c) the function of the controls used in human mtDNA analysis with regard to interpretation, comparison, statistical evaluation, and reporting of the sample results;
- d) the quality control steps pertaining to human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, comparison, statistical evaluation, and reporting;
- e) the laboratory's procedures pertaining to mtDNA interpretation, comparison, statistical evaluation, and reporting.

4.4.3 Practical Competency

The trainee shall successfully complete a practical test covering human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, comparison, statistical evaluation, and reporting protocols for which he or she will be independently authorized to perform. The trainee, at a minimum, shall be able to satisfactorily perform the following:

- a) properly and accurately execute human mtDNA analysis, interpretation, statistical evaluation, and reporting procedures;
- b) apply the laboratory's interpretation and comparison procedures to a variety of evidentiary casework -or database-type samples, as applicable to the trainee;
- c) operate relevant equipment, instrumentation, and software used in the laboratory for human mtDNA interpretation and comparison;
- d) correctly document work performed in accordance with laboratory procedures.

5. Conformance

In order to demonstrate conformance with this standard, the laboratory shall meet Section 5 of the ANSI/ASB Standard 022, *Standard for Forensic DNA Analysis Training Programs*.

Annex A (informative)

Bibliography

The following bibliography is not intended to be an all-inclusive list, review, or endorsement of literature on this topic. The laboratory shall develop a list tailored to its specific needs. The goal of the bibliography is to provide examples of publications addressed in the standard.

- 1] Andrews, R. M., Kubacka, I., Chinnery, P. F., Lightowlers, R. N., Turnbull, D. M., and Howell, N. "Reanalysis and revision of the Cambridge Reference Sequence for human mitochondrial DNA." *Nature Genetics*, 1999, Vol. 23, pp.147.
- 2] Bandelt H-J, Parson W. "Consistent treatment of length variants in the human mtDNA control region: a reappraisal." *International Journal of Legal Medicine*, 2008, vol. 122, pp.11-21.
- 3] Butler, J. M. *Advanced Topics in Forensic DNA Typing: Methodology*. Academic Press, 2012, chapter 14, pp. 405-456.
- 4] Carracedo, A. et al. "DNA Commission of the International Society for Forensic Genetics: Guidelines for mitochondrial DNA typing." *Forensic Science International*, 2000, vol.110(2), pp.79-85.
- 5] Clopper, C.J. and Pearson, E. S. "The use of confidence or fiducial limits illustrated in the case of the Binomial." *Biometrika*, 1934, Vol. 26, pp. 404-413.
- 6] Irwin, JA., et al. "Investigation of heteroplasmy in the human mitochondrial DNA control region: a synthesis of observations from more than 5000 global population samples." *Journal of Molecular Evolution*, 2009, vol. 68(5), pp. 516-27.
- 7] Just, R.S., et al. "Mitochondrial DNA heteroplasmy in the emerging field of massively parallel sequencing." *Forensic Science International: Genetics*, 2015, vol. 18, pp. 131-9.
- 8] McElhoe, J., et al. "Development and assessment of an optimized next-generation DNA sequencing approach for the mtGenome using the Illumina MiSeq." *Forensic Science International: Genetics*, 2014, vol. 13, pp. 20-9.
- 9] Melton, T. "Mitochondrial DNA heteroplasmy." *Forensic Science Review*, 2004, vol.16, pp.1-20.
- 10] Melton, T. et al. "Forensic mitochondrial DNA analysis: current practices and future potentials." *Forensic Science Review*, 2012, vol. 24, pp. 101-22.
- 11] Parson, W., et al. "DNA Commission of the International Society for Forensic Genetics: revised and extended guidelines for mitochondrial DNA typing." *Forensic Science International: Genetics*, 2014, vol. 13, pp. 134-42.

- 12] Parson, W, Dur, A. "EMPOP- a forensic mtDNA database." *Forensic Science International: Genetics*, 2007, vol. 1(2), pp. 88-92.
- 13] Polanskey, D., et al, "Comparison of Mitotyper Rules and Phylogenetic-based mtDNA Nomenclature Systems." *Journal of Forensic Science*, 2010, vol. 55(5), pp. 1184-9.
- 14] Röck, A., et al "SAM: String-based sequence search algorithm for mitochondrial DNA database queries." *Forensic Science International: Genetics*, 2011, vol. 5(2), pp.126-32.
- 15] Schönberg, L.M., et al. "Detecting heteroplasmy from high throughput sequencing of complete human mitochondrial DNA genomes." *The American Journal of Human Genetics*, 2010, vol. 87, pp. 237-49.
- 16] Scientific Working Group on DNA Analysis Methods (SWGDM). *Interpretation Guidelines for Mitochondrial DNA Interpretation*.¹
- 17] Tully, G., et al. "Considerations of the European DNA Profiling (EDNAP) group on the working practices, nomenclature and interpretation of mitochondrial DNA profiles." *Forensic Science International*, 2001, vol. 124(1), pp. 83-91.

¹ https://1ecb9588-ea6f-4feb-971a-73265dbf079c.filesusr.com/ugd/4344b0_f61de6abf3b94c52b28139bfff600ae98.pdf.

DRAFT



Academy Standards Board
410 North 21st Street
Colorado Springs, CO 80904

www.asbstandardsboard.org